

(Episode 68)

The fabricated and fake converses

The author : Father Zakaria Boutros
The publisher: www.fatherzakaria.com

Abu-Hurairah was one of the most famous narrators of prophetic converses

In the book of a "quick glance" by Abdul Samad shaker, page 36: he said that Abu - Hurairah was a big liar"

In the book of "lights on the Mohammedan Sunnah (laws)" by Mahmoud Abu Rayah, page 193 and 299 he said: "Omer Ibn Al-Khatib was tying him, and beating him hard for his repeated lies, to stop him from fabricating converses"

Abdul Samad shaker said in his book " quick glance" : Abu Salma said to Abu- Hurairah would you say those converses during the time of Omer?, Abu- Hurairah said: if I said such converses during the time of Omer, as I am telling you now, he would definitely scourge me with his whip"

In Sahih Al-Bokhary, converse number 5040, in the book of expenditure:"narrated Abu – Hurairah: I memorized from the messenger of God two groups of converses , one of them I said to you , and the other one , If I say it, I would have my throat cut "

Abdul Samad shaker said in his book "_quick glance" there is no doubt , if Omer was alive, Abu- Hurairah wouldn't be able to tell his converses, or he would have his throat cut"

The Islamic encyclopedia, part 11, and page 3514:" there were liars, fabricating converses, attributing them to the prophet, and there were silly people who believed their lies, and thought those converses were true and accepted them

Also lot of Israeli converses were narrated by people and lot of mistakes were made in the narration of the converses by some narrators"

The subject of the converses:

That is a big and complicated issue

In the Islamic encyclopedia, part 11, and page 3501 and 3508:" although the major six books of converses had a great value, but there was a big criticism of the converses mentioned in them, and there was no consensus on their veracity

Al-Darqatly mentioned in a special book about 200 weak converses mentioned in Sahih Al-Bokhary and Sahih Muslim

The scholars view on the converses:

In the Islamic encyclopedia, part 11, and page 3499:" although Muslims were cursing those fabricating the fake converses , but there were other considerations taken for those converses , by time no one dared to show any skepticism in those converses

It was not possible to consider a man like Abu-Hurairah among the liars

In general they approved many converses, even those containing very obvious historical errors

By time those old discrepancies lost their significance among the new generations, even if they were contradicting with each other

And refusing the converses became an extrinsic behavior to adopt

The number of the true converses:

In the book of "the science of the converses" by Mr.Sobhy Al-Saleh, he said:"

- Al-Bokhary accredited four thousands converses among 600 thousands of them
- Muslim accredited three thousands converses among 300 thousands
- Abu- Dawûd accredited only 4700 converses among half a million converses
- Mosnad Ahmed accredited only 800 converses among 750 thousands
- Abu- Hanifa accepted only 170 converses

Types of converses:

The science of the converses divided the converses into two divisions:

1) True converses

Those free from skepticism and challenging and accepted by all

2) Weak or untrue converses

Those are of so many types of them:

The intruded, the incomplete, the untraceable, the extrinsic, the ambiguous, the vague, the denied, the belied, and the Israeli converses

The fake converses:

- Al-Nyssa'y, in his book (the weak narrators) mentioned the names of about 600 of the fabricators of those intruded converses

- In the book of "lights on the Mohammedan Sunnah (laws)" by Mahmoud Abu Rayah, page 174:' some of those famous narrators of the fabricated converses were: Moujahid, Abdul -Kader Al-Gazaly, Abu -Taleb Al-Mahdy, Abdullah Ibn Salem and Abu- Hurairah"

- In the book of "the afternoon of Islam" by Ahmed Amin, he wrote:' As there were fabrications of converses, the converses were increasing by time, so in the Amaoian epoch there were more converses than during the time of the Caliphs

And during the Othmanian epoch, they were more than the Amaoian epoch, so as times goes on more converses were added, that's a definite proof for their fabrication

Why there were fake converses;

Sahih Muslim, converse number 72 said" the main reason behind the presence of fake converses was that Muhammad was not keen of documenting the converses during his time, so the truth was lost"

There were also political and denominational reasons behind that, as lot of people in their trials for promoting their denomination, they fabricated converse and attributed them to the prophet

Al-Sunnah people said that: the prophet said about the Rafedh, Al-Khawarej and Al-Shia'h people, if they agree together on any converse, they would say that it was narrated from the prophet

While Al-Shia'h people said about Al-Sunnah:" they took converses made by Aeisha and others, and Al-Shia'h approved only those converses narrated by Ali-Ibn Abe Taleb

Abu- Hurairah narrated: the messenger peace upon him said:" there will be a man named Muhammad Ibn Idris Al-shafe'y, he will be more harmful than Satan on my nation, and a man named Al-No' man Ibn Hanifa will be the light of my nation

{The history of Baghdad by Al-Khateeb Al-Boghdady, part 13, page 333}

-In the book of "the science of the converses" by.Sobhy Al-Saleh, page 270:" if we try to trace the fabricated converse we wouldn't count them all

As "Al-Zanadequ'a" people put about 14 thousands fake converses,

"Abdul-Karim Ibn Abe-Al-Ao'da' put about four thousand converses, when they took him for execution he told them I made for you four thousand converses, justifying the unlawful and banning the lawful { the book of "the science of the converses" by.Sobhy Al-Saleh, page 270}

- in an article written by Ahmed Sobhy Mansour (an ex-professor in Al-Azhar) on 31/10/2004 in Al-Nabae' newspaper about the fabricated converses he said:" the prophetic converses depend on gesture and not certainty, so many converses had been fabricated and attributed to the prophet after his death, and some attributed to the companions, and they were unaware of that converses put on their tongues made by those fabricators"

Al-Dahaby said in "Tazkarat Al-Hafez", part 1 and page 5:"narrates Aisha: my father (Abe Baker Al-Sedeak) collected the prophetic converses they were 500 converses, he went to sleep one night but was uncomfortable, in the morning he came asking me to bring the converses that I keep with me , he took them and burned them all saying : I am afraid to die while you are keeping them with you ,and within them there may be converses for someone I trusted , but he was not honest in is narration"

- In " Al-Tabakat Al-Kobra" by Ibn Saad , part 5, and page 188 , he said that " while Omer was speaking to the people, he said :bring to me all the books of converses , they brought them to him , he took them and burned them all

So all the converses were burned during the time of Abe Baker Al-Sedeak and Omer, so how did the converses we have now reach us???

- On that the Islamic encyclopedia, part 11, and page 3506 said:" those converses were the products of the third Hijri century"

Do you need stronger proof than that for the fabrication of the converses?

The converses are an essential source of legislation in Islam

Islam depends on the quran and the converses in its legislations

So with that great skepticism in the veracity of the converses, one of the two basic pillars of Islam is doubtful, that will arouse suspicion in the Islamic legislation itself

How could Islam build itself on a fabricated and doubtful pillar?